



CITIZENS' COMMISSION
on Elected Official
Compensation

AGENDA

October 30, 2018 – 2:00 p.m.
Columbus City Hall, Conference Room 225

I. Welcome and Call to Order – Chair Ransier

II. Approval of the minutes of the September 13, 2018 meeting – Chair Ransier

Chair Ransier will ask for a motion, second and approval of the minutes of the last meeting.

III. Council President Salary Recommendations – Commission Members

The Commission will discuss suggested recommendations regarding compensation for City Council President.

IV. Council Member Salary Recommendations – Commission Members

The Commission will discuss suggested recommendations regarding compensation for City Council Members.

V. Adjournment

**THE CITY OF
COLUMBUS**
CITIZENS' COMMISSION
on Elected Official
Compensation

Meeting Minutes for the Citizens' Commission on Elected Officials Compensation

September 13, 2018 @ 11:00 a.m.

Columbus City Hall, Conference Room 225

Attendance:

- Fred L. Ransier III, Commission Chair
- Joel Diaz, Commissioner
- Diana Givand, Commissioner
- Robert J. Weiler, Sr., Commissioner
- Michal S. Brown, Chief of Staff to the Council President, Columbus City Council
- Adam Friedman, Senior Policy Advisory, Office of the Mayor
- Greg Beaverson, Compensation Manager, Department of Human Resources
- Jo Ellen Cline, Legal Analyst & Ethics Officer, Columbus City Council
- Lauren Herderick, Columbus Department of Human Resources

Chair Ransier called the meeting to order at 11:05 a.m.

The minutes of the August 20, 2018 meeting were approved as submitted.

The Commission began its deliberations regarding recommendations for elected official salaries. Because the Commission had been provided a large amount of information and data over the past few meetings, the Chair took the time to ensure that all Commissioners were on the same page as to what the projected salaries charts meant as far as a starting point for deliberations. Once there was clarity on this issue, the Commission came to an informal agreement to utilize the CPI index that Dr. Bill LaFayette suggested in his presentation – CPI-U, National, Size Class A, All Items.

The Commission discussed the base salary of the Mayor as it may exist in 2021. Based upon the projections and the Commissions desire that the Mayor be compensated in a manner that reflects the responsibilities of the office, the Commission suggested that the 2021 base salary be increased by 2% effective on January 1, 2022 and that a COLA be added in each subsequent year. The Commission then decided that, instead of voting on that suggestion immediately, it would discuss the other elected officials and vote when consensus had been reached on all positions. The Commission did, however, take up the issue of the COLA and upon motion by Commissioner Diaz and a second by Commissioner Weiler, the Commission unanimously recommends that the COLA for the years 2023 – 2026 be calculated utilizing the CPI-U, National, Size Class A, All Items CPI per the requirements of the Columbus City Charter.

The Commission then discussed the base salary for Councilmembers. Pointing out the workload of councilmembers, the upcoming change in Council structure, the growth of the city and the projected population growth, Commissioners believed that Councilmembers' base salary needed a significant

THE CITY OF
COLUMBUS
CITIZENS' COMMISSION
on Elected Official
Compensation

increase. Commissioners felt that a significant increase for the years 2022 – 2026 would allow the Councilmembers' salary to "catch-up" to levels that accurately reflect the responsibilities of the office. The Commission believed staggering the larger percentage increase over the 2022-2026 time period would mitigate the budgetary impact of the recommendation. There was consensus that an overall 25% increase in base salary was required to adequately compensate Councilmembers. The suggestion was to increase the base by 10% in 2022 and 5% in each subsequent year and, in addition, apply the standard COLA. Commissioners then applied the same thoughts to the position of Council President.

Finally, the Commission discussed the compensation of City Attorney and City Auditor. First, the Commission discussed the idea of parity in compensation between the two positions. Commission Chair Ransier noted that it is difficult to ignore that the Columbus City Auditor makes significantly more than city auditors in peer city. Chief of Staff Brown, who provided the Commission with a memorandum, outlined that the Columbus City Auditor has, over the years, taken on significantly more responsibility and an expansive role in city government. The Auditor's responsibilities are more on par with that of a company Chief Financial Officer as opposed to a traditional auditor role. Commissioners were clear that they had no desire to reduce the amount either official will be making in 2021. Commissioners suggested that keeping parity between the positions would be justified because the Auditor will have an important role to play in the growth of the city and, as a city that wants to retain its talent given the responsibilities of the offices; both positions require a high level of professionalism and experience.

Having completed their discussion of each office, the Commission voted unanimously on separate motions to recommend the following:

Mayor:	Effective 1/1/2022 - 2% increase in 2021 base salary Effective 1/1/2023 - 2022 Base salary + COLA Effective 1/1/2024 - 2023 Base salary + COLA Effective 1/1/2025 - 2024 base salary + COLA
Councilmember:	Effective 1/1/2022 – 10% increase in 2021 base salary Effective 1/1/2023 – 5% increase in 2022 base salary Effective 1/1/2024 - 5% increase in 2023 base salary Effective 1/1/2025 – 5% increase in 2024 base salary
Council President:	Same as Councilmember
City Attorney:	Effective 1/1/2022 - 4% increase in 2021 base salary Effective 1/1/2023 - 2022 Base salary + COLA Effective 1/1/2024 - 2023 Base salary + COLA Effective 1/1/2025 - 2024 base salary + COLA



CITIZENS' COMMISSION
on Elected Official
Compensation

City Auditor: Same as City Attorney

Having completed its work, the Commission thanked staff for their work and staff expressed its appreciation to each of the Commissioners for their service. A final report will be circulated to Commission members when completed.

With no further business to come before the Commission, the Commission adjourned at 12:35 p.m.

MEMORANDUM

TO: Citizens' Commission on Elected Official Compensation

FROM: Jo Ellen Cline

DATE: October 22, 2018

RE: October 30, 2018 Meeting

On September 13, 2018 the Citizens' Commission on Elected Official Compensation made recommendations for all municipal elected officials including City Council President and City Council Members.

September 13, 2018 Recommendation:

January 1, 2022: Base Salary Then in Effect + 10%
January 1, 2023: Base Salary Then in Effect + 5% + COLA
January 1, 2024: Base Salary Then in Effect + 5% + COLA
January 1, 2025: Base Salary Then in Effect + 5% + COLA

The Columbus City Attorney's Office interpretation of the Columbus City Charter Section 15 and the original legislative intent of the Charter Review Commission is that an increase to the base salary in 2023 – 2025 is not permissible; therefore, the Compensation Commission cannot stagger the recommended 25% increase to the base salary over the 4 year period. The Commission has decided to reconvene to discuss its intention as to the salaries of City Council President and City Council Members and if it would like to modify its original recommendation to honor those intentions.

In preparing for this meeting staff has been asked to assemble some additional information. Attached to this memorandum are the following:

- A salary projection chart for both Council President and Council Member which highlights base salary increases of 10%, 15%, 20%, and 25% and, as the projection charts previously submitted to the Commission, shows what those increases may result in for 2025 salaries with a 1.48% COLA.
- Tables showing the salaries of Council President and Council Member in comparison to peer cities. The comparison cities are those that have a "strong mayor/council" structure as that structure is most similar to the municipal government structure in Columbus.

Staff was also asked to determine what percentage increase to the base salary then in effect on January 1, 2022 would be necessary to get the Council President and Council Members a salary in 2025 that was approximately the same as the projected amount the Commission believed these elected officials deserved. The percentage difference for both offices is 29.2% (difference between the 2021 base salary and the calculated final 2025 salary without COLA).

Staff will be available at the Commission's meeting on October 30, 2018 to provide any additional information or explanations of the attached that the Commission may require. In the meantime, if you require any additional information or clarifications, please do not hesitate to contact me.



Council President Projected Salary Table (1.48% COLA Added to Base Salary

2021 Base 73,687	2022 1.48% COLA	2023 1.48% COLA	2024 1.48% COLA	2025 1.48% COLA	4-Year Percentage Change	Average Annual Increase
0%	74,778	75,884	77,007	78,147	5%	1%
1%	75,525	76,643	77,777	78,929	6%	1%
2%	76,273	77,402	78,548	79,710	7%	2%
3%	77,021	78,161	79,318	80,491	8%	2%
4%	77,769	78,920	80,088	81,273	9%	2%
5%	78,516	79,678	80,858	82,054	10%	2%
6%	79,264	80,437	81,628	82,836	11%	3%
7%	80,012	81,196	82,398	83,617	12%	3%
8%	80,760	81,955	83,168	84,399	13%	3%
9%	81,508	82,714	83,938	85,180	14%	3%
10%	82,255	83,473	84,708	85,962	15%	4%
11%	83,003	84,232	85,478	86,743	16%	4%
12%	83,751	84,990	86,248	87,525	17%	4%
13%	84,499	85,749	87,018	88,306	18%	5%
14%	85,246	86,508	87,788	89,088	19%	5%
15%	85,994	87,267	88,558	89,869	20%	5%
16%	86,742	88,026	89,329	90,651	21%	5%
17%	87,490	88,785	90,099	91,432	22%	6%
18%	88,238	89,543	90,869	92,214	23%	6%
19%	88,985	90,302	91,639	92,995	24%	6%
20%	89,733	91,061	92,409	93,776	25%	6%
21%	90,481	91,820	93,179	94,558	26%	7%
22%	91,229	92,579	93,949	95,339	27%	7%
23%	91,976	93,338	94,719	96,121	29%	7%
24%	92,724	94,097	95,489	96,902	30%	7%
25%	93,472	94,855	96,259	97,684	31%	8%

Councilmember Projected Salary Table (1.48% COLA Added to Base Salary)

2021 Base 61,257	2022 1.48% COLA	2023 1.48% COLA	2024 1.48% COLA	2025 1.48% COLA	4-Year Percentage Change	Average Annual Increase
0%	62,164	63,084	64,017	64,965	5%	1%
1%	62,785	63,714	64,657	65,614	6%	1%
2%	63,407	64,345	65,298	66,264	7%	2%
3%	64,029	64,976	65,938	66,914	8%	2%
4%	64,650	65,607	66,578	67,563	9%	2%
5%	65,272	66,238	67,218	68,213	10%	2%
6%	65,893	66,869	67,858	68,863	11%	3%
7%	66,515	67,499	68,498	69,512	12%	3%
8%	67,137	68,130	69,139	70,162	13%	3%
9%	67,758	68,761	69,779	70,812	14%	3%
10%	68,380	69,392	70,419	71,461	15%	4%
11%	69,002	70,023	71,059	72,111	16%	4%
12%	69,623	70,654	71,699	72,760	17%	4%
13%	70,245	71,284	72,340	73,410	18%	5%
14%	70,867	71,915	72,980	74,060	19%	5%
15%	71,488	72,546	73,620	74,709	20%	5%
16%	72,110	73,177	74,260	75,359	21%	5%
17%	72,731	73,808	74,900	76,009	22%	6%
18%	73,353	74,439	75,540	76,658	23%	6%
19%	73,975	75,070	76,181	77,308	24%	6%
20%	74,596	75,700	76,821	77,958	25%	6%
21%	75,218	76,331	77,461	78,607	26%	7%
22%	75,840	76,962	78,101	79,257	27%	7%
23%	76,461	77,593	78,741	79,907	29%	7%
24%	77,083	78,224	79,381	80,556	30%	7%
25%	77,705	78,855	80,022	81,206	31%	8%

STRONG MAYOR/COUNCIL PEER CITIES

COUNCIL PRESIDENT SALARIES

City	Council President	Designation	Outside Employment	
			Allowed	Employed
Nashville/Davidson Co.	17,000	Part-Time	Yes	None
Memphis	30,970	Part-Time	Yes	Most
Lexington	35,185	Full-Time	Yes	Most
Cincinnati	65,700	Full-Time	No	None
Columbus	69,451	Undefined	Yes	Most
Milwaukee	82,749	Full-Time	No	None
Detroit	82,776	Full-Time	No	None
Cleveland	90,133	Full-Time	No	None
St. Louis	90,766	Undefined	Yes	
Minneapolis	98,695	Full-Time	No	None
Denver/ Denver County	102,928	Full-Time	No	None
Seattle	123,359	Full-Time	No	None

COUNCIL MEMBER SALARIES

City	Council Member	Designation	Outside Employment	
			Allowed	Employed
Nashville/Davidson Co.	15,000	Part-Time	Yes	None
Memphis	29,070	Part-Time	Yes	Most
Lexington	32,266	Full-Time	Yes	Most
Columbus	57,741	Undefined	Yes	Most
Cincinnati	65,700	Full-Time	No	None
Milwaukee	73,222	Full-Time	No	None
Detroit	78,761	Full-Time	No	None
Cleveland	80,133	Full-Time	No	None
St. Louis	87,310	Undefined	Yes	
Denver/ Denver County	91,915	Full-Time	No	None
Minneapolis	98,695	Full-Time	No	None
Seattle	123,359	Full-Time	No	None